LDPL: A Language Designer’s Pattern Language

by

Tiffany Winn, B.Sc.(Comp.Sc)(Hons)

School of Informatics and Engineering,
Faculty of Science and Engineering

November 22, 2006

A thesis presented to the
Flinders University of South Australia
in total fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Adelaide, South Australia, 2006
© (Tiffany Winn, 2006)
# Contents

Contents ............................................................................................................................................. i

List of Figures ................................................................................................................................. iv

List of Tables ................................................................................................................................. vi

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... vii

Certification ....................................................................................................................................... ix

Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................................... x

Publications ..................................................................................................................................... xii

Chapter 1    Introduction ................................................................................................................ 1

  1.1 Research Goals ....................................................................................................................... 3

  1.2 Contributions .......................................................................................................................... 3

  1.3 History of Research on Patterns in Software ......................................................................... 6

  1.4 Structure of the Document ...................................................................................................... 9

Chapter 2    Foundations of Patterns ............................................................................................... 10

  2.1 Pattern Basics .......................................................................................................................... 10

  2.1.1 What is a Pattern: Insights from Software Developers ....................................................... 12

  2.1.2 What is a Pattern: Insights from Alexander ........................................................................ 13

  2.1.3 The Multidisciplinary Nature of the Pattern Concept ......................................................... 14

  2.1.4 Multidisciplinary Pattern Theory ....................................................................................... 18

  2.2 Examples of Patterns ............................................................................................................. 19

  2.2.1 Software Patterns ............................................................................................................... 20

  2.2.2 Architectural Patterns ......................................................................................................... 24

  2.2.3 Patterns in Physics and Biology ......................................................................................... 27

  2.2.4 Patterns in Other Domains ................................................................................................. 29

  2.3 What is a Pattern Language? .................................................................................................... 32

  2.3.1 What is a Pattern Language: a Software Perspective .......................................................... 32
2.3.2 What is a Pattern Language: an Architectural Perspective .......... 34
2.3.3 What is a Pattern Language: Other Perspectives ...................... 37
2.4 Examples of Pattern Languages ..................................................... 39
  2.4.1 Software Pattern Languages ......................................................... 40
  2.4.2 Alexander’s Pattern Language for Architecture ......................... 44
  2.4.3 Pattern Languages in Other Domains ........................................... 45
2.5 Defining Key Elements of a Pattern ................................................. 47

Chapter 3 Software Design ................................................................. 49
  3.1 Patterns and Software Design ......................................................... 49
  3.1.1 Patterns and Other Design Tools .................................................. 49
  3.1.2 Task-Oriented Abstract Algorithms ............................................. 54
  3.1.3 Refactoring .................................................................................. 55
  3.1.4 Unified Modeling Language (UML) ............................................. 56
  3.1.5 Extreme Programming (XP) ....................................................... 58
  3.1.6 Agile Development ..................................................................... 60
  3.1.7 International Organization for Standardization (ISO) 9000 ............ 61
3.2 Analyzing Relationships Between Patterns ....................................... 62
  3.2.1 Pattern Relationships: Object-Oriented Design Patterns ............... 62
  3.2.2 Pattern Relationships: a Broader Focus ....................................... 66

Chapter 4 Symmetry Breaking and Patterns ........................................ 68
  4.1 Introduction to Symmetry and Symmetry breaking ......................... 69
  4.2 Symmetry in Software .................................................................. 73
  4.3 Symmetry Breaking and Software Patterns ..................................... 76
  4.3.1 Bridge ....................................................................................... 76
  4.3.2 Half-Object Plus Protocol (HOPP) ............................................. 78
  4.3.3 Establishing a Formalism for Symmetry in Software .................... 78
  4.4 Symmetry and the Theory of Centers ............................................ 80

Chapter 5 A Language Designer’s Pattern Language ............................ 84
  5.1 A Basis for LDPL ........................................................................... 84
  5.1.1 A Pattern Language is a Designed System .................................. 85
  5.1.2 A Pattern Language is a Complex System .................................. 85
  5.1.3 Evolved Systems Provide Insight .............................................. 87
# List of Figures

Figure 2-1: A HOPP object.......................................................................................................................... 20
Figure 2-2: The structure of a Handle/Body object ..................................................................................... 22
Figure 2-3: The Mediator pattern and its use in the PRISM system.............................................................. 23
Figure 2-4: Photos of entrance transitions in architecture ............................................................................ 24
Figure 2-5: A sketch of an entrance transitions in architecture ............................................................... 25
Figure 2-6: A sketch of the structure of an accessible green ........................................................................ 26
Figure 2-7: A photograph of an accessible green ....................................................................................... 26
Figure 2-8: Dewdrops on a spider web ........................................................................................................ 28
Figure 2-9: A milk-drop splash .................................................................................................................... 30
Figure 2-10: A language for a half-hidden garden ...................................................................................... 35
Figure 2-11: The language structure of the idioms language ..................................................................... 41
Figure 4-1: The symmetries of a starfish ..................................................................................................... 68
Figure 4-2: A milk-drop splash .................................................................................................................... 69
Figure 4-3: The Bridge pattern implemented for a number hierarchy ...................................................... 77
Figure 5-1: Using LDPL to build pattern languages that can then build systems ................................. 90
Figure 5-2: The language structure of LDPL ............................................................................................. 93
Figure 5-3: Tree Places ............................................................................................................................... 112
Figure 5-4: The transformation made by Handle/Body .............................................................................. 113
Figure 5-5: The transformation made by Counted Body ............................................................................ 114
Figure 5-6: The transformation made by Whole Value ............................................................................. 115
Figure 5-7: The transformation made by Exceptional Value ..................................................................... 116
Figure 5-8: The transformation made by HOPP ..................................................................................... 118
Figure 5-9: Embryonic development ......................................................................................................... 120
Figure 5-10: A language for creating a garden ..........................................................134
Figure 5-11: Structure of the idioms language ..........................................................135
Figure 5-12: Adding Reference Counting to the Idioms Language .........................147
Figure 6-1: The language structure of the idioms language ......................................155
Figure 6-2: The transformation made by Handle/Body ..........................................158
Figure 6-4: The transformation made by Envelope/Letter ......................................160
Figure 6-5: Local symmetries created by Counted Body .......................................163
Figure 6-6: Local symmetries created by Concrete Data Type ...............................166
Figure 6-7: Local symmetries created by Detached Counted Body .......................168
Figure 6-8: Incorporating Reference Counting into the idioms language ...............169
Figure 6-9: Local symmetries created by Algebraic Hierarchy .............................173
Figure 6-10: Algebraic Hierarchy and surrounding patterns .................................174
Figure 6-11: Algebraic Hierarchy and surrounding patterns: a new structure.........177
List of Tables

Table 1: The fifteen fundamental properties described by Alexander.........................82
Abstract

Patterns provide solutions to recurring design problems in a variety of domains, including that of software design. The best patterns are generative: they show how to build the solution they propose, rather than just explaining it. A collection of patterns that work together to generate a complex system is called a pattern language. Pattern languages have been written for domains as diverse as architecture and computer science, but the process of developing pattern languages is not well understood.

This thesis focuses on defining both the structure of pattern languages and the processes by which they are built. The theoretical foundation of the work is existing theory on symmetry breaking. The form of the work is itself a pattern language: a Language Designer’s Pattern Language (LDPL). LDPL itself articulates the structure of pattern languages and the key processes by which they form and evolve, and thus guides the building of a properly structured pattern language. LDPL uses multidisciplinary examples to validate the claims made, and an existing software pattern language is analyzed using the material developed.

A key assumption of this thesis is that a pattern language is a structural entity; a pattern is not just a transformation on system structure, but also the resultant structural configuration. Another key assumption is that it is valid to treat a pattern language itself as a complex, designed system, and therefore valid to develop a pattern language for building pattern languages.

One way of developing a pattern language for building pattern languages would be to search for underlying commonality across a variety of existing, well known pattern languages. Such underlying commonality would form the basis for patterns in LDPL. This project has not directly followed this approach, simply because very few pattern languages that are genuinely structural have currently been explicitly documented. Instead, given that pattern languages articulate structure and behavior of complex systems, this research has investigated existing complex systems theory – in particular, symmetry-breaking – and used that theory to underpin the pattern language. The patterns in the language are validated by examples of those patterns within two well known pattern languages, and within several existing systems whose pattern
languages have not necessarily been explicitly documented as such, but the existence of which is assumed in the analysis.

In addition to developing LDPL, this project has used LDPL to critique an existing software pattern language, and to show how that software pattern language could potentially have been generated using LDPL. Existing relationships between patterns in the software language have been analyzed and, in some cases, changes to patterns and their interconnections have been proposed as a way of improving the language.

This project makes a number of key contributions to pattern language research. It provides a basis for semantic analysis of pattern languages and demonstrates the validity of using a pattern language to articulate the structure of pattern languages and the processes by which they are built. The project uses symmetry-breaking theory to analyze pattern languages and applies that theory to the development of a language. The resulting language, LDPL, provides language developers with a tool they can use to help build pattern languages.
Certification

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

As requested under Clause 14 of Appendix D of the *Flinders University Research Higher Degree Student Information Manual* I hereby agree to waive the conditions referred to in Clause 13(b) and (c), and thus

- Flinders University may lend this thesis to other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research;
- Flinders University may reproduce this thesis by photocopying or by other means, in total or in part, at the request of other institutions or individuals for the purpose of scholarly research.

Signed                                      Dated

Tiffany Winn
Acknowledgements

I would first like to thank my supervisor, Paul Calder, for his support in so many ways. Thanks, Paul, for giving me the freedom to choose a research area that particularly interested me, providing high quality research feedback, being so loyal to me and all your research students, and supporting the life decisions I’ve made even when it’s made thesis progress slower.

Experienced patterns guru James Coplien made several trips to Australia to work with the patterns group here at Flinders. During these visits he made a considerable contribution to the thesis.

Many of my fellow postgrads have been supportive in different ways. To Ron Porter, you are a wonderful person and a dear friend. Thanks so much for being a listening ear and offering good advice so many times. To Denise de Vries, thanks for all your help with Word. To Denise, Aaron Ceglar, Darius Pfitzner, and others in the KDIS group, thanks for your research feedback.

Staff members at Flinders have also offered support. Thanks to John Roddick for your contributions to the KDIS group, and Robert Goodwin for lots of little pieces of good advice, not to mention eggs and oranges! Thanks to Murk Bottema for reading a draft of the thesis. Thanks to Mike Schwarz for feedback on many of the biological examples. Thanks to the technical staff members, especially Rino Calacay and Michael Young, for your patience and willingness to answer even basic technical questions. Thanks to Leonie and the Postgraduate Students’ Association (PGSA) for excellent and much needed advice and advocacy on all kinds of issues.

So many friends have given me support over the years. To Wendy and Simon, how do I say thanks for all the support? You’ve been wonderful. To Jen, Cat, and Anna, thanks so much for your friendship and support when I’ve really needed it. To Marianne V., it’s been great to catch up when we can; thanks for your friendship. Thanks to Judy and Andrew for your regular commitment to the kids; it has made life so much easier for me. Thanks to the Prestons and the Manns for child care, and to Lisa especially for your friendship and support. To those at Walkerville Uniting Church who have been truly supportive – thanks so much for your respect, understanding, and graciousness. May you be recognized one day as the true leaders
that you are! To Emma and the Monday Night Church community at Rosefield, thanks for loving and supporting me on my journey.

To my godkids, Jesse and Jordan, you are great fun as well as hard work. It is a privilege to share in your growing up.

Above all, I would like to thank my parents for supporting me in the life choices I have made, and especially for supporting me, Jesse and Jordan over the last two years. It has certainly been an adventure!

Tiffany Winn
November 2006
Adelaide
Publications

The following publications have resulted from research done as part of preparing this thesis:


