AN ASSESSMENT OF PERFORMANCE AND SUSTAINABILITY OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS:

A Case Study of Village Credit Institutions in Gianyar, Bali, Indonesia

by
Lincolin Arsyad

Doctorandus in Economics, Gadjah Mada University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
Master of Science, the University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA

Thesis Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Faculty of Social Sciences, Flinders University
Adelaide, Australia
2005
ABSTRACT

Microfinance institutions have evolved as an economic development tool intended to benefit low-income people. The benefit, however, can only be achieved if the institutions have a good financial and outreach performance. This study has three objectives. The first objective is to assess the influences of informal and formal institutions and their interrelationships on the practical operational arrangement of Village Credit Institutions of Bali (Lembaga Perkreditan Desa or LPD). Second, to evaluate the financial performance and outreach indicators of the institutions and to assess the influence of informal and formal institution on the sustainability of the institutions, which has received little attention from previous studies. Finally, to outline some elements of a strategic business plan for two selected village credit institutions (LPDs) in Gianyar district, LPD Mas and LPD Kerta.

By using a case study approach, this study finds that the informal institutions (such as social values, norms, and sanctions) have significant influences on the practical arrangements of the LPDs, including the organisation, recruitment procedure, delivery mechanism, and remuneration system. Along with the influence of informal institutions, the formal institutions have also had some direct influences on the practical operational arrangements of the LPDs that are reflected in the supervision and guidance system of LPDs, an obligation to apply prudential principles of banking, and the remuneration system. The findings also show that the local government regulations (formal institutions) concerning the LPDs have accommodated the informal institutions of the Balinese in the background of their establishment, status and ownership, and organisation of the LPDs.

Based on the performance indicators - portfolio quality, leverage, capital adequacy ratio (CAR), productivity, efficiency, profitability, self-sufficiency, and outreach – the LPDs in Gianyar district could be considered as success microfinance institutions. The success is influenced by some important factors. First, the use of local people in managing the LPDs and the application of character-based lending system in screening the clients. This has resulted in a high clients’ sense of belonging and moral obligation to support the development of the LPD. Second, the use of social (custom) sanctions in the contractual enforcement has forced the borrowers to comply with their credit contract in a timely fashion. Third, the use of local community personnel whose remuneration is based on performance and low transaction costs has resulted in the high efficiency of LPDs. Fourth, a growing economy and supporting government policy at all levels through provision of a legal basis for the LPDs and the Central Bank regulation (formal institutions) have also contributed to the success of the LPDs. Thus, based on the necessary conditions of sustainable microfinance institution proposed by some scholars (Yaron 1994; Christen 1998), it can be concluded that the Gianyar district LPDs have been sustainable, and by that implication they have positive net social benefits for their clients.

Any attempt, however, to replicate the achievements of the LPDs by imitating its mode of operations should be conducted with great caution. A mechanism that works well in one socioeconomic environment (in this instance, in Bali) will not necessarily work in another, where the social system including social norms and values are different. But, the experience of the LPDs is a valuable thing since it has highlighted some critical issues that should be considered when handling the complex issue providing financial services to rural people.
CANDIDATE’S DECLARATION

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university, and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another except where due reference is made in the text.

Lincoln Arsyad
/ /2005

SUPERVISORS’ DECLARATION

We believe that this thesis is properly presented, conforms to the specifications of thesis presentation in the University and is prima facie worthy of examination.

Assoc. Professor Susanne Schech
/ /2005

Joe Williams
/ /2005
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank Associate Professor Susanne Schech from Development Studies within the School of Geography, Population and Environmental Management, and Dr. Don Fuller and Joe Williams, MBA from the School of Business Economics at Flinders University who supervised this thesis. Dr. Schech’s broader development perspective enriched my analysis and interpretation of the research material. Dr. Fuller and Mr. Williams guided this thesis with their knowledge of business economics, and gave me much encouragement and support to enable completion of the study.

This thesis would not have been possible without the financial support provided by the Quality for Undergraduate Education (QUE) Project funded by the World Bank. I would like to give my thanks to Mr. Faried Widjaja Mansoer and Mr. Ahmad Jamli, who managed the project. I am also grateful to all my colleagues at the Research Center for Economic and Public Policy Studies of Gadjah Mada University for their warm attention and support for my study, among others: M. Masykur Wiratmo, Wihana K. Jaya, Akhmad Makhfatih, Catur Sugiyanto, and Tri Widodo.

Many great thanks go to my senior colleagues at the Faculty of Economics at Gadjah Mada University for their encouragement, among others: Dr. Soetatwo Hadiwigeno, Professor Sukanto Reksohadiprodjo, Professor Nopirin, Professor Zaki Baridwan, Dr. Iswardono S. Permono, and Rimawan Pradiptyo who is now at York University, UK. I would particularly like to thank Professor Gunawan Sumodiningrat for introducing me to the world of microfinance ten years ago. Many thanks also go to my friends in Adelaide for their warm and sincere friendship, among others: John Soeprihanto, M. Mas’ud Said, I Gusti Ngurah Darmawan, Afrizal, Mirza Hasan, Edi Winarko, Andy Fefta Widjaja, Aldian Amira, Muhammad Wayong, and Siswanda Hadisumarto.

I wish to thank a number of individuals and organizations who greatly assisted the fieldwork of this study, in particular Wayan Dade Wiweka and Ida Bagus Mayun

Last but not least, I would like to thank my family for their love and support throughout my study. Many great thanks go to my wife, Ine, who constantly supported and encouraged me throughout the entire process. I owe her the utmost debt of gratitude. My three lovely children, Vania, Senna, and Gibran also deserve to receive my great thanks. I sincerely hope that my success will inspire them. Lastly, I would like to thank my Mum and my parents in law in my country for blessing me throughout my life and study.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ............................................................................................................................ i
CANDIDATE’S DECLARATION ............................................................................................. i
SUPERVISORS’ DECLARATION ......................................................................................... ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ..................................................................................................... iii
TABLE OF CONTENT .......................................................................................................... v
LIST OF FIGURES ............................................................................................................. ix
LIST OF TABLES ................................................................................................................ x
ABBREVIATIONS .............................................................................................................. xii

CHAPTER ONE ......................................................................................................................
INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................
1.1 THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY ..............................................................................
1.2 MICROFINANCE AND MSEs DEVELOPMENT IN INDONESIA ..............................................
1.3 OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS ..............................................
1.4 ORGANISATION OF THE THESIS ......................................................................................

CHAPTER TWO ......................................................................................................................
MICROFINANCE, INSTITUTIONS, AND PERFORMANCE: A LITERATURE REVIEW ..............................................
2.1 INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................
2.2 DEFINITION AND CHARACTERISTICS OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS ..............................................
2.3 THE ROLE OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS AS FINANCIAL INTERMEDIARIES ......................
2.4 INSTITUTIONS AND MICROFINANCE PERFORMANCE ..............................................................
Imperfect information in credit markets ..............................................................................
The role of institutions on the performance and sustainability of microfinance institutions ..............................................
2.5 PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTION ..............................................
2.6 SUMMARY ...........................................................................................................................

v
CHAPTER THREE

MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS IN INDONESIA: THEIR DEVELOPMENT, LANDSCAPE, AND REGULATION

3.1 INTRODUCTION

3.2 THE DEVELOPMENT OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS IN INDONESIA
The Colonial Period
Independence Period
(1) During the Soekarno administration
(2) Soeharto administration until present

3.3 THE LANDSCAPE OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS IN INDONESIA

3.4 LEGISLATION, REGULATION, AND SUPERVISION OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS IN INDONESIA
Regulation and supervision for the Bank BRI Unit Desa
Regulation and supervision of People’s Credit Bank (BPR)
Regulation and supervision of non-bank financial Institutions
Regulation and supervision of cooperatives and NGOs

3.5 SUMMARY

CHAPTER FOUR

THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC ENVIRONMENT OF BALI

4.1 INTRODUCTION

4.2 GEOGRAPHIC AND DEMOGRAPHIC CONDITIONS

4.3 GOVERNMENT ADMINISTRATION SYSTEM

4.4 SOCIO-CULTURAL CHARACTERISTICS

4.5 ECONOMIC SITUATION

4.6 SUMMARY

CHAPTER FIVE

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

5.1 INTRODUCTION

5.2 RESEARCH PARADIGMS AND TRIANGULATION

5.3 A CASE STUDY STRATEGY

5.4 RESEARCH DESIGN

5.5 METHODS AND TOOL OF ANALYSIS

(1) Quantitative analysis
CHAPTER SIX ................................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
THE ROLE OF INSTITUTIONS IN THE MANAGEMENT OF VILLAGE CREDIT INSTITUTIONS OF BALI ................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.

6.1 INTRODUCTION ...................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
6.2 THE DEVELOPMENT OF LEMBAGA PERKREDITAN DESA Error! Bookmark not defined.
6.3 THE LEGISLATIONS OF LEMBAGA PERKREDITAN DESA Error! Bookmark not defined.
6.4 SUPERVISION AND GUIDANCE SYSTEM OF THE LPD Error! Bookmark not defined.
6.5 THE MANAGEMENT OF LPD........................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
organisation and planning ........................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
Recruitment procedure ........................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Principle of operational arrangement.......................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Delivery mechanism ................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Remuneration system............................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
6.6 SUMMARY ................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.

CHAPTER SEVEN .............................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS ............................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
OF VILLAGE CREDIT INSTITUTIONS WITHIN GIANYAR DISTRICT IN BALI PROVINCE ................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.

7.1 INTRODUCTION ...................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
7.2 SOCIO-ECONOMIC INDICATORS OF GIANYAR DISTRICT Error! Bookmark not defined.
7.3 THE GROWTH OF LPD OF GIANYAR DISTRICT Error! Bookmark not defined.
7.4 PORTFOLIO QUALITY, LEVERAGE, AND CAPITAL ADEQUACY Error! Bookmark not defined.
7.5 PRODUCTIVITY AND EFFICIENCY .............................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
7.6 PROFITABILITY AND FINANCIAL VIABILITY ................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
7.7 OUTREACH ............................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
7.8 FACTORS AFFECTING REPAYMENT RATE: A LOGISTIC ANALYSIS Error! Bookmark not defined.
7.9 SUMMARY ................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.

CHAPTER EIGHT .............................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
CREATING ELEMENTS OF A STRATEGIC BUSINESS PLAN FOR LPD MAS OF UBUD AND LPD KERTA OF PAYANGAN, GIANYAR DISTRICT, BALI Error! Bookmark not defined.

8.1 INTRODUCTION ...................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
8.2 SWOT ANALYSIS OF LPD MAS OF UBUD, GIANYAR, BALI Error! Bookmark not defined.
Summary of main strengths ....................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Summary of main weaknesses ..................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Summary of opportunities ......................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Summary of threats .................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Main implications of the SWOT Analysis ..................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Recommended Mission Statement for LPD Mas of Ubud Error! Bookmark not defined.
Recommended Objectives for LPD Mas of Ubud

Recommended Strategies for LPD Mas of Ubud

8.3 A SWOT ANALYSIS OF LPD KERTA OF PAYANGAN, GIANYAR, BALI

Summary of main strengths
Summary of main weaknesses
Summary of opportunities
Summary of threats
Main implications of the SWOT Analysis

Recommended Mission Statement for LPD Kerta of Payangan

Recommended Objectives for LPD Kerta of Payangan

Recommended Strategies for LPD Kerta of Payangan

CHAPTER NINE

TOWARDS A SUSTAINABLE MICROFINANCE INSTITUTION

9.1 INTRODUCTION

9.2 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

The influence of informal institutions
The influence of formal institutions
The relationship between informal and formal institutions

9.3 IMPLICATIONS OF THE STUDY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

APPENDICES
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 Assessing the Performance of Microfinance Institutions Error! Bookmark not defined.
Figure 4.1 Map of Indonesia............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
Figure 4.2 Map of Bali Province and Its Administrative Subdivisions Error! Bookmark not defined.
Figure 6.1 LPD Organisation and Supervision............... Error! Bookmark not defined.
Figure 9.1 Factors Affecting Performance and Sustainability of Village Credit Institutions (LPDs) of Bali ......................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
### LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1  Micro, Small, Medium, and Large Enterprises in Indonesia, 1999-2003...........................................................................................................  Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 1.2  Number of Establishments of Small-scale Manufacturing Industry in Bali Province by Source of Capital Ownership, 1996 Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 2.1  Microfinance Assessment Performance Approaches Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 2.2  The Performance Indicators of Microfinance Institutions (Ledgerwood’s Approach) ...........................................  Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 3.1  Landscape of Microfinance Institutions in Indonesia Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 3.2  Size of Microfinancial Services in Indonesia.. Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 3.3  Supervisory Arrangements of Microfinance Institutions in Indonesia Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 3.4  BRI Village Unit Loan Classification and Reserves Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 4.1  Land Area, Population, and Population Density of Bali Province by City/Districts, 2001 .................................................................  Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 4.2  City/Districts, Sub-districts, and Administrative Villages in Bali Province, 2001.................................................................  Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 4.3  Distribution of Gross Regional Domestic Product of Bali Province at Constant 1993 Price by City/district, 1996 and 1999 Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 4.4  Employment by Economic Sectors in Bali Province, 1997 and 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 5.1  Number of LPDs in Gianyar District by Sub-districts and Economic Characteristic, 2001 .................................................................  Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 5.2  Independent Variables and Expected Signs of Logit Model for the Repayment Rate of the LPDs Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 5.3  SWOT Scoring Interpretation Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 6.1  Selected Indicators of LPD Development Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 6.2  Distribution of LPDs in Bali by District, 1998 and 2000 Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 7.1  Socio-economic Indicators of Gianyar District of Bali Province, 1997 and 2001 .................................................................  Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 7.2  General indicators of Village Credit Institutions (LPDs) within Gianyar District of Bali Province, 1999-2001 Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 7.3  Portfolio quality, leverage, and CAR of LPDs within Gianyar District of Bali Province, 1999 and 2001 (means) ...... Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 7.4  Arithmetic Means and the Results of the Mann-Whitney Test for Portfolio Quality, Leverage, and CAR between Two Group of LPDs, 2001 .................................................................  Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 7.5  Productivity and Efficiency of LPDs within Gianyar District of Bali Province, 1999 and 2001 (Means).............. Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 7.6  Arithmetic Means and the Results of the Mann-Whitney Tests for Productivity and Efficiency between Two Groups of LPDs, 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 7.7  Profitability and Financial Viability of LPDs within Gianyar District of Bali Province, 1999 and 2001 (Means)...... Error! Bookmark not defined.

Table 7.8  Arithmetic Means and Results of the Mann-Whitney Tests for Profitability and Financial Viability between Two Groups of LPDs, 2001 .................................................................  Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 7.9  Outreach of LPDs within Gianyar District of Bali Province, 1999 and 2001
Table 7.10  A Comparison of Some Outreach Indicators between Two Groups of LPDs, 2001
Table 7.11  Arithmetic Means and the Results of the Mann-Whitney Test for the Outreach between Two Groups of LPDs, 2001
Table 7.12  Logistic Regression Analysis of the Repayment Rate
Table 8.1  SWOT Analysis Table LPD Mas of Ubud, Gianyar, Bali
Table 8.2  SWOT Analysis Table LPD Kerta of Payangan, Gianyar, Bali
## ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AVB</td>
<td>Algemeene Volkscredietbank (General Popular Credit Bank), a precursor of BRI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank Pasar</td>
<td>market bank, a secondary bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank Umum</td>
<td>general bank, the first of two bank categories recognized by the 1992 Banking Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BI</td>
<td>Bank Indonesia (Central Bank of Indonesia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIMAS</td>
<td>Bimbingan Massal (Mass Guidance), the government’s subsidized agricultural credit program operated through BRI, 1970-175.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BKD</td>
<td>Badan Kredit Desa (village credit board), village-owned credit organizations established in the late 19th century during the Dutch colonial era; today they are supervised by BRI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BKK</td>
<td>Badan Kredit Kecamatan, sub-district credit board in Central Java and South Kalimantan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPD</td>
<td>Bank Pembangunan Daerah (Regional Development Bank), classified as general bank under the 1992 Banking Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRI</td>
<td>Bank Rakyat Indonesia (People’s Bank of Indonesia), a state-owned bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRI Unit Desa</td>
<td>The lowest-level permanent outlet of BRI which is located in at sub-district level and provide financial services to the villages of their sub-districts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPR</td>
<td>Bank Perkreditan Rakyat (People’s Credit Bank)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPUPKI</td>
<td>Badan Penyelidik Untuk Persiapan Kemerdekaan Indonesia (Investigation Committee for the Preparation of Indonesia’s Independent)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAMEL</td>
<td>Capital, Asset quality, Management, Earnings, Liquidity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAR</td>
<td>Capital Adequacy Ratio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGAP</td>
<td>Consultative Group to Assist the Poorest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBPKMI</td>
<td>Gerakan Bersama Pengembangan Keuangan Mikro Indonesia (United Movement for the Development of Indonesian Microfinance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRDP</td>
<td>Gross Regional Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNP</td>
<td>Gross National Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GTZ</td>
<td>Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (German Agency for Technical Assistance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDT</td>
<td>Inpres Desa Tertinggal (Presidential Instruction on Backward Villages)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KLBIs</td>
<td>Kredit Likuiditas Bank Indonesia (Bank Indonesia liquidity credits)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KOSIPA</td>
<td>Koperasi Simpan Pinjam (Saving and Loan Cooperative)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KSM</td>
<td>Kelompok Swadaya Masyarakat (Self-help Group)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KUD</td>
<td>Koperasi Unit Desa (Village Unit Cooperative)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KUK</td>
<td>Kredit Usaha Kecil (small business credit program)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KUKESRA</td>
<td>Kredit Usaha untuk Kesejahteraan Rakyat, the credit component of Prosperous Family Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KUPEDES</td>
<td>Kredit Umum Pedesaan, the loan product of BRI’s unit desa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KURK</td>
<td>Kredit Untuk Rakyat Kecil, small enterprise credit institutions in East Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KUT</td>
<td>Kredit Usaha Tani (Credit for Farm Enterprise Program), a government-subsidised agricultural credit that is channeled through BRI’s branches, but not through BRI Unit Desa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDKP</td>
<td>Lembaga Dana dan Kredit Pedesaan, rural fund and credit institutions owned by provincial or local governments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPD</td>
<td>Lembaga Perkreditan Desa, village-owned credit institution/s supervised by the provincial government of Bali</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPN</td>
<td>Lumbung Pith Nagari, Village’s Credit Bank in West Sumatra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFI</td>
<td>Microfinance Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NBFI</td>
<td>Non-bank Financial Institution</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NGO  Non-government Organization

P4K  *Pembinaan Peningkatan Pendapatan Petani-Nelayan Kecil* (Income Generating Program for Small Farmers and Fishermen), a program sponsored by Indonesia’s Ministry of Agriculture

PERBARINDO  *Persatuan Bank BPR seluruh Indonesia* (Association of Indonesian Rural Credit Banks)

PHBK  *Pengembangan Hubungan Bank dengan KSM* (Project Linking Banks with Self-help Groups)

PLPDK  *Pembina Lembaga Perkreditan Desa Kabupaten/Kota*

PLPDP  *Pembina Lembaga Perkreditan Desa Propinsi*

PT  *Perusahaan Terbatas* (limited company)

ROSCA  Rotating Saving and Credit Association (Kelompok Arisan)

SIMASKOT  *Simpanan Perkotaan* (urban savings), a savings product offered by BRI’s Unit Desa

SIMPEDES  *Simpanan Pedesaan* (rural savings), a savings product offered by BRI’s Unit Desa

SME  Small and Medium Enterprise

UNDP  United Nations Development Programme

USAID  United States Agency for International Development

WOCCU  World Council of Credit Unions