Writes of passage: a comparative study of newspaper obituary practice in Australia, Britain and the United States

Nigel Starck
Master of Arts (RMIT)

A thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of Humanities (English)
FACULTY OF EDUCATION, HUMANITIES, LAW AND THEOLOGY
Flinders University
Adelaide - Australia

Date of submission: April 2004
Table of contents

List of figures ix
Glossary and style notes xii
Summary xiii
Declaration of originality xv
Acknowledgments xvi

Introduction 2
A posthumous preamble 2
Aims and directions 3
Background to the research 4
Thesis structure 7
Methodology 8

*Interviews: editors & writers*
*Interviews: university/specialist lecturers*
*Personal communication (mail, email, telephone): editors & writers*
*Personal communication: university/specialist lecturers*
*Lines of enquiry*

Potential consequence and contribution of the research 14

chapter one

Definitions in death literature: the obituary as a first draft of history 15
Lives and transitions 15
Obituary: the word 16
Obituary: the practice 18
Necrology: news story and obituary perspectives 22
Change in obituary and biography definition 25
Defining the more distant relations 26

*Elegy*
*Eulogy*
*Panegyric*
*Hagiography*
*Epitaph*

Death notices 32

Conclusions 34
chapter four

The force of circumstances: decline of the obituary in the 20th century 94

Britain
Words, war and withdrawal: The Telegraph and The Guardian 1902–1939 94
Rations and relocation 98
Splendid isolation at The Times 100
‘There will be an interval’ 103

United States
Decline and renewal follow ‘The Angel of Death’ 108
A much overdue delivery in Washington 109
Confederate memories and segregation in the South 111
An ‘A-list’ obituary agenda for Los Angeles 113

Australia
From apogée to apology in Sydney and Melbourne 115
The repression of talents 119
From artistry to obscurity in Brisbane 121
Inconsistency in Perth, neglect in Adelaide 122
Pictorial in name and act 124
Slow evolution in Canberra 124
A ‘truly national’ event 126
Conclusions 126

chapter five

Revival of a dying art 129

Britain
The antecedents of change 129
The end of the street 130
Massingberd, Fergusson, and Grigg: agents of revival 131
Four British broadsheets: what happened next 136
The Daily Telegraph
The Independent
The Guardian
The Times
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>United States</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A sense of independent renewal</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An American quartet: four newspapers at a time of revival</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The New York Times</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Washington Post</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Los Angeles Times</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Atlanta Journal-Constitution</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Australia</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The quest for paper-of-record standing</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Australian group of eight: seeking the right credentials</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Herald Sun</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Australian</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Age</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Sydney Morning Herald</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Advertiser</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Canberra Times</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The West Australian</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Courier-Mail</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>chapter six</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contemporary obituary practice (Britain):</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>matters for judgment</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Death brings freedom and restraint</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part One: Publication principles</strong></td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Candour, complaint and code</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Matters of ethical judgment: bounders and villains</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Gender imbalance</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part Two: The discipline of newspaper style</strong></td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Authorship: signed versus unsigned</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Names and ages</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Cause of death</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Survivors: the last paragraph</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Time for posthumous reflection</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Illustrating the obituary</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
chapter seven

Contemporary obituary practice (United States): matters for judgment

An American legacy

Part One: Publication principles

1.1 A mindset of news
1.2 American candour: an ethical debate
1.3 Of villains and heroes
1.4 The non-pursuit of gender balance

Part Two: The discipline of newspaper style

2.1 Lead and attribution
2.2 Names and ages
2.3 An obsession with cause
2.4 Those who are left
2.5 Alacrity is the essence
2.6 Posthumous illustration
2.7 Paid obituaries
2.8 A codicil to life

Conclusions

chapter eight

Part One. Contemporary obituary practice (Australia): content analysis

Quantitative data

Qualitative information

1.1 Author/Source

1.1.1 Herald Sun
1.1.2 The Australian
1.1.3 The Age
1.1.4 The Sydney Morning Herald
1.1.5 The Advertiser
1.1.6 The Canberra Times
1.1.7 The West Australian
1.2 Demographic selection 252
  
  1.2.1 Herald Sun
  1.2.2 The Australian
  1.2.3 The Age
  1.2.4 The Sydney Morning Herald
  1.2.5 The Advertiser
  1.2.6 The Canberra Times
  1.2.7 The West Australian

1.3 Age specification 259

1.4 Cause of death 262

1.5 Dominant reference 265
  
  1.5.1 Herald Sun
  1.5.2 The Australian
  1.5.3 The Age
  1.5.4 The Sydney Morning Herald
  1.5.5 The Advertiser
  1.5.6 The Canberra Times
  1.5.7 The West Australian

1.6 Gender balance 275

1.7 Postscript – The Courier-Mail 279
  
  1.7.1 Author/Source (The Courier-Mail)
  1.7.2 Demographic selection (The Courier-Mail)
  1.7.3 Age specified: incidence of inclusion (The Courier-Mail)
  1.7.4 Cause of death specified: incidence of inclusion (The Courier-Mail)
  1.7.5 Dominant reference (The Courier-Mail)
  1.7.6 Gender balance (The Courier-Mail)

Conclusions – Part One 283

chapter eight

Part Two. Contemporary obituary practice (Australia): matters for judgment 284

2.1 Strengths and achievements 284
  
  2.1.1 Publication principles
  2.1.2 The discipline of newspaper style

2.2 Inadequacy and inconsistency 299
  
  2.2.1 Publication principles
  2.2.2 The discipline of newspaper style

Conclusions – Part Two 311
chapter nine

Directions for Australian obituary practice 312

Towards the optimum obituary 312

1. Impose editorial control
2. Separate sentiment from obituary
3. Exercise coherent and consistent style
4. Study international practice
5. Build resources
6. Serve the causes of culture and history
7. Education

Endnotes 323
Bibliography 367
List of figures

Figure 1.1  **News-obituary split.** Differing values captured on the same page: the obituary (top) recounted the former CIA director's life, while the news story (bottom) reported the discovery of his body. (*New York Times*, 7 May 1996) 24

Figure 3.1  **Early obituary.** The year is 1664, the dateline ‘Edinburgh, May 31’: Roger L'Estrange’s Newes printed one of the first recognisable obituaries. Its subject was the Earl of Glencairn, a loyal monarchist, who had ‘dyed the 30th of the Instant of a Feavour in the 49th year of his Age’. (*Newes*, 9 June 1664) 60

Figure 3.2  **Lincoln assassinated.** President Lincoln was shot at 9.30pm on 14 April 1865 in Ford’s Theatre, Washington. In the morning, the *New-York Times* carried a detailed report under multiple headlines. Its obituary, in a subsequent edition, described him as ‘a man so gentle, so kind, so free from every particle of malice or unkindness’. (*New-York Times*, 15 April 1865) 78

Figure 3.3  **First Australian obituary.** ‘Death’, a minimalist headline by George Howe, the convict editor-printer, introduced the first original obituary in Australia. Its subject was James Bloodworth, building superintendent of New South Wales, who had come to the colony in 1788: ‘the first house in this part of the Southern hemisphere was by him erected’. (*Sydney Gazette and New South Wales Advertiser*, 25 March 1804) 84

Figure 5.1  **An agent of change.** The legacy of James Fergusson, obituaries editor of the *Independent* since its inception in 1986: author credits, emphatic pictorial content, and a capsule of life history in a ‘go-last’. These features have contributed significantly to the British obituary transformation. (*Independent*, 15 October 2002) 141

Figure 5.2  **A sign of changing times.** *Times* obituaries now dominate a section entitled ‘The Register’, with application of the ‘go-last’ and bold photography. In this edition, one of the subjects had earned a reputation for boldness too: Henry de Lotbinière, who endured seventeen operations following cancer of the salivary gland. The identity of his obituary’s author is not indicated – a style point discussed in Chapter Six. (*Times*, 8 October 2002) 148

Figure 5.3  **Supporting cast.** José Ferrer, of film fame, was remembered by the *Washington Post* alongside a retired beer salesman, a former manicurist and a crossword deviser. The *Post* maintains a pronounced ‘local newspaper’ character, publishing 6,000 obituaries every year. (*Washington Post*, 27 January 1992) 155

Figure 5.4  **Creative direction.** Ethel Winant’s obituary demonstrates a classic *Los Angeles Times* formula: an entertainment industry narrative allied to the creative use of photography and white space. (*Los Angeles Times*, 3 December 2003) 157

Figure 5.5  **Contrasting subjects.** The first ‘Time & Tide’ page in Australia’s national daily, the *Australian*, carried the obituaries of a corrupt magistrate and a distinguished surgeon. The detail of the ‘stand-first’ life summaries has been cut back over the years, as too has the appearance record of ‘Time & Tide’ itself (see Chapter Eight). (*Australian*, 6 December 1993) 166
Figure 5.6 Contrasting styles. A family contribution and a wire service obituary in the *Age* (Melbourne): while one contains extensive extracts from a eulogy and is delivered with a profound sense of personal loss, the other offers an anonymous, objective appraisal by a *Daily Telegraph* writer. (Age, 11 August 2003)

Figure 5.7 Told and untold. The *Sydney Morning Herald* emphasises its homespun obituary contributions by labelling them ‘Untold Stories’. This tactic eases the transition in style, found here in shifting from the *Guardian* obituary of Hildegard Knef (‘great stage success’ in ten years on Broadway) to the life story of Joan Elliott (‘teacher, mother, wife’). (*Sydney Morning Herald*, 8 February 2002)

Figure 6.1 Hero and villain. Controversial juxtaposition: a decorated RAF pilot and an al-Qaeda terrorist are united in the *Times*. Defending this decision, the obituaries editor argued that selection for his page was governed by the degree to which potential subjects had ‘helped shape the world we live in, or affected its political history’. (Note: the *Times* obituaries page used the spelling ‘Muhammad’; a subsequent syndicated article on this incident, printed in the *Australian*, preferred ‘Mohammed’, as indicated in the text of Chapter Six. (*Times*, 19 November 2001)

Figure 6.2 Unsigned omniscience. The *Daily Telegraph*, like the *Times*, has maintained its practice of unsigned obituaries: it confers, says the editor, an ‘Olympian and omniscient’ quality. In this instance, discretion was practised too. The obituary of Professor Phil Williams, physicist and politician, omitted all reference to the circumstances of his death; instead, it allowed a separate news story to report that he had died at a massage parlour (see Chapter One). (*Daily Telegraph*, 13 June 2003)

Figure 6.3 Death tableau. The body of Sasha, Lady Young, flanked by her daughter and her husband: he explained in a letter to the editor of the *Guardian* that, as a Buddhist, his wife had believed in ‘openness about death’. (*Guardian*, 26 June 1993)


Figure 7.2 Tribune tributes. Paid obituaries, according to an American editor interviewed for this thesis, give bereaved relatives ‘the freedom to say things that can’t be said in the news formula’. Those relatives spend freely too: the daily publication of pages such as this, from the *Salt Lake Tribune*, has restored the advertising revenue of newspapers across the United States. (*Salt Lake Tribune*, 22 December 2002)

Figure 8.1 Author/source – *Herald Sun* 241

Figure 8.2 Author/source – The *Australian* 243

Figure 8.3 Author/source – *The Age* 245

Figure 8.4 Author/source – The *Sydney Morning Herald* 247

Figure 8.5 Author/source – The *Advertiser* 248

Figure 8.6 Author/source – *The Canberra Times* 250

Figure 8.7 Author/source – *The West Australian* 252

Figure 8.8 Demographic selection (leading categories) – *Herald Sun* 253
Figure 8.9  Demographic selection (leading categories) – *The Australian*  254
Figure 8.10  Demographic selection (leading categories) – *The Age*  255
Figure 8.11  Demographic selection (leading categories) – *The Sydney Morning Herald*  256
Figure 8.12  Demographic selection (leading categories) – *The Advertiser*  257
Figure 8.13  Demographic selection (leading categories) – *The Canberra Times*  257
Figure 8.14  Demographic selection (leading categories) – *The West Australian*  258
Figure 8.15  Age specified: incidence of inclusion  261
Figure 8.16  Cause of death specified: incidence of inclusion  263
Figure 8.17  Dominant reference – *Herald Sun*  268
Figure 8.18  Dominant reference – *The Australian*  269
Figure 8.19  Dominant reference – *The Age*  270
Figure 8.20  Dominant reference – *The Sydney Morning Herald*  271
Figure 8.21  Dominant reference – *The Advertiser*  272
Figure 8.22  Dominant reference – *The Canberra Times*  273
Figure 8.23  Dominant reference – *The West Australian*  274
Figure 8.24  Male/female subject incidence  276
Figure 8.25  Obituary length – male/female average  278
Figure 8.26  Author/source – *The Courier-Mail*  280
Figure 8.27  Demographic selection (leading categories) – *The Courier-Mail*  281
Figure 8.28  Dominant reference – *The Courier-Mail*  282
Figure 8.29  The unforgettable. Jason Moran’s life story demonstrates the changing character of the obituary page. The rogue element in society need no longer be consigned to the ‘forgotten dead’ identified in Chapter Two’s literature review. (*Australian*, 25 June 2003)  289
Figure 8.30  Delicate theme. A note of ‘astonishment that he should have chosen to end his life’: John Ince’s obituary in the *West Australian*. While the fact of his suicide was conveyed with clarity, the words used to report it were selected judiciously. (*West Australian*, 22 August 2003)  294

Figure 9.1  The beginning. The central character of Leithauser’s novel is dead, and his obituary enshrines in print a fabricated life history.  314
Figure 9.2  The end. The heavily sub-edited *Oracle* obituary reveals the ‘reality’ of its subject’s life and death.  315
Figure 9.3  Global model. Canada’s *Globe and Mail* offers a model for Australian obituary pages seeking improved fortunes: a blend of its own and syndicated material, historical features, and a guaranteed appearance six days a week. Above all, it has a proprietor (Lord Thomson of Fleet) known as a ‘guardian angel’ of obituary publication. (*Globe and Mail*, 5 December 2003)  318
Glossary of terms

boilerplate obituary  American term for an obituary which offers a brief, formulaic account without anecdote or character appraisal
by-line  name of the author, printed below the headline
decks  lines of headlines
end-credit  name of the author, printed after the closing paragraph
go-last  capsule of life history at the end of an obituary
lead  opening paragraph of a newspaper item
pull-quote  a brief text extract, often from a passage of direct speech, presented as a design feature in larger type
side-bar  a secondary article featuring some aspect of a main story
stand-first  capsule of life history at the head of an obituary
wire service  news agency or other news organisation which disseminates reports or information to clients for publication

Style note: punctuation

1. In some instances, to achieve clarity of meaning, the punctuation of archival passages has been adjusted so that it conforms with the style applied elsewhere in the thesis.
2. The allegiance of this thesis to newspaper practice finds further expression in the style adopted for quotation marks attached to passages of direct speech. Their rendition follows journalism convention, in that
   - Complete quotes have the closing inverted comma outside the punctuation point which indicates the passage’s conclusion, as in: ‘Just last week, a widow I was interviewing didn’t want the first wife’s name in,’ recalls Tim Bullamore, of the Times. ‘I insisted on including it, but managed to convince her I wasn’t interested in why the marriage had ended.’ (Chapter Six)
   - Incomplete quotes have the closing inverted comma inside the punctuation point which indicates the sentence’s conclusion, as in: Her obituary in the Post said that at times she had ‘been known to give rudeness a bad name’. (Chapter Seven)

Style note: numbers

The text of this thesis adopts for the greater part a traditional Humanities approach, in that numbers less than 100 are spelt out. The following exceptions are applied:
   - Linked ordinals, as in: ‘19th century’.
   - Numbers expressed as percentages.
   - Ages (to match newspaper style, numbers above nine are presented in figures).
   - When numbers are attached to units of linear measurement, as in: ‘64 column centimetres’. (Chapter Eight)
   - Figures contained in quoted passages are reproduced without change.
Summary

Australian newspapers in recent years have increased significantly the column space devoted to obituaries. The Sydney Morning Herald, the Australian, the Age, the West Australian, the Herald Sun, the Canberra Times, the Advertiser, and the Courier-Mail now publish them in dedicated sections, often allocating an entire page to the obituary art. Their popularity in Australia follows a pattern established during the 1980s in Britain and the United States. Australian practice has been influenced in particular by developments in British journalism, which has seen a phenomenon described by the Wall Street Journal as ‘an odd revival…the rebirth of long newspaper obituaries’.†

In its first incarnation, the obituary can be traced to the newsbooks of England which appeared in the 1660s, during the Restoration. It flowered in the 18th century, in the first daily newspapers and magazines; it grew luxuriant, and sometimes ornate, in the 19th century; it became unfashionable and fell into some general neglect in the 20th. Then, with the appointment of reformist editors and, particularly in Britain, the publication of bigger newspapers by an industry no longer subjected to labour restraint, the obituary itself experienced restoration.

Though the momentum of renewed practice has been of mutual rapidity on three continents, there are some significant variations in its application. The American product generally favours a style faithful to news-writing principles so far as timing and content are concerned and is frequently expansive when relating the details of surviving family and funeral arrangements. In Britain, the emphasis is more on creative composition and a recitation of anecdotes, with less of a sense of urgency about news value and a consequent accent on character sketch. Both models, in recent years, have displayed a propensity for explicit appraisal and an increasing willingness to publish obituaries of those who have undermined, rather than adorned, society.

Newspapers in Australia, while adopting the obituary with apparent fervour, have found their delivery of the product restrained by a lack of resources. Obituary desks in this country are staffed by a solitary journalist-editor. This has resulted in a reliance, often to an unhealthy degree, on contributions by readers. The tone of this material, with its intimacy of address and excess in sentiment, sits uneasily when appearing on the same page as obituaries syndicated from overseas sources.

Contemporary obituary publication in the United States has been subjected to some scholarly analysis in terms of gender balance, identification of cause of death, and the demographic mix of its subject selection. This thesis, by means of a six-month content analysis, addresses such questions for the first time in an Australian context. In addition, it examines issues of style, origin and authorship. It finds that cause of death is identified much less than is the case in American obituary practice, that women are significantly under-represented, and that editing is sometimes haphazard.

Nevertheless, the accumulated body of evidence points resolutely to a remarkable reinvigoration of practice in Australia's daily newspapers. The thesis, by discussing the views of specialists in the field of obituary publication, pursues mechanisms for sustaining the momentum and for improving the product.
Declaration

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgment any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university, and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

Nigel Starck

April 2004
Acknowledgments

Lewis (‘Jimmy’) Mason, a local newspaper editor with fierce glasses and a nicotine-tinged moustache, deserves to be at the head of this list. He sent me on an obituary assignment when I was a trainee reporter just out of school and quite unsuited for the task. He sent me back to the bereaved family when my first effort was inadequate in the matter of the deceased’s war service details; among my many failings had been the inability to elicit the matter of a World War I cavalry charge. He sent me back again when my second draft was inadequate in the matter of offspring names and funeral minutiae. He was of kindly disposition behind the bristly facade, so, when he rewrote entirely my third attempt, he translated it into a eulogy and gave it the quaint headline ‘He loved animals’. However, Mr Mason (cadet reporters were not intimate, to his face) had, by his example, made me appreciate the obituary art’s demands of accuracy and completeness, and that lesson has been of persistent value in the composition of this thesis.

I am indebted also to Brian Austin, a former colleague and one of Jimmy Mason’s successors as editor, for making archival material available. As a once youthful and reluctant obituarist himself, he understands the peculiar nature of the job, particularly when the deceased happened to be placed in the front parlour for a viewing at the time the reporter called. In the matter of the obituary family at large, my thanks extend too in the direction of Dallas, Texas, the home of the International Association of Obituaries. This organisation, especially its founder, Carolyn Gilbert, provided much sustenance for my research. Its members’ willingness to engage in conversation and correspondence has, I feel, endowed these chapters with an authentic voice. A particular acknowledgment is owed also to the association’s honorary archivist, Thomas C. Hobbs, of the University of South Carolina (Aiken), for granting me access to his papers. In Britain, my appreciation of contemporary journalism practice was assisted by the counsel of Alan Moultrie, a former managing editor of the Kent Messenger newspaper group; in the United States, Steve Miller, obituaries editor of the New York Sun, proved an engaging source of information.

Dr Max Waugh, a Melbourne historian, and Dr Rod Kirkpatrick, of the Australian Newspaper History Group, directed me towards areas of archival interest; Dr Lorna Clymer, of California State University, graciously allowed me to quote a passage of her paper on early expressions of death literature; Derek Burns ensured that a record was kept of obituary publication while I was away on field research; Christopher Hamilton, consulting psychologist, offered specialist advice on the management of quantitative findings; Dr Rhodri Davies supplied expertise in the realisation of charts which appear in Chapter Eight; Edwina Starck read proofs when the work had achieved a measure of maturity; Barbara Brougham, as production editor, brought her considerable skill to the union of word and image. It was my good fortune, in addition, to be able to consult Dr Brett Gooden, general practitioner, on medical terminology, Frances Conroy, of Pulteney Grammar School, on Latin terminology, and Julie Burns, of the University of South Australia, on database sources.

† ‘He loved animals’, 1959, Herne Bay Press [UK], 27 Mar.: 4
Editors, writers, teachers of the craft of writing, librarians and obituary enthusiasts – in Australia, Britain, the United States and Canada – have responded to my many requests and enquiries with generosity and enterprise. The names of some appear in the endnotes; the contributions of all enrich the text.

The process has been nurtured by the guidance of my academic supervisors, Associate Professor Peter Morton and Dr Bernard Whimpress. They have proved wise, resourceful, inspiring. To them, and to the support staff at the Flinders University of South Australia, my profound thanks. I can but hope that, when Drs Morton and Whimpress reflect on this thesis, the words of George Herbert have some application: ‘A diligent Scholler, and the Master’s paid’.  

---